2019/03/05 13:36:26 1 /11

STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

AUSTIN OFFICE

300 West 15th Street Suite 504 Austin, Texas 78701 Phone: (512) 475-4993

Fax: (512) 322-2061

DATE:

3/5/2019

NUMBER OF PAGES INCLUDING THIS COVER SHEET:

11

REGARDING:

ORDER NO. 5 - RULING ON PARTY STATUS

DOCKET NUMBER:

952-19-0705

FAX TO:	JUDGE MICHAEL J OMALLEY FAX TO:
ERIC ALLMON	(512) 482-9346
GREGORY M. ELLIS	VIA EMAIL
PAUL TERRILL	(512) 474-9888
DOUGLAS G. CAROOM	VIA EMAIL
EMILY ROGERS (BICKERSTAFF HEATH DELGADO ACOSTA, LLP)	VIA EMAIL
MARY A. KEENEY (GRAVES DOUGHERTY HEARON & MOODY)	VIA EMAIL
NATASHA MARTIN (GRAVES DOUGHERTY HEARON & MOODY)	VIA EMAIL
DONALD H. GRISSOM	VIA EMAIL
	VIA EMAIL
J. TROUPE BREWER (LLOYD GOSSELINK ROCHELLE & TOWNSEND, P.C.)	(512) 472-0532
MICHAEL A. GERSHON (LLOYD GOSSELINK ROCHELLE & TOWNSEND, P.C.)	VIA EMAIL
LYN CLANCY (LOWER COLORADO RIVER AUTHORITY)	VIA EMAIL
VERNA L DEMENT	VIA REGULAR MAIL
JC JENSEN	VIA REGULAR MAIL
RICHARD MARTINEZ	VIA REGULAR MAIL
JAMES ALAN TATE	VIA REGULAR MAIL
ELVIS AND ROXANNE HERNANDEZ	VIA EMAIL

xc: Docket Clerk, State Office of Administrative Hearings

NOTE: IF ALL PAGES ARE NOT RECEIVED, PLEASE CONTACT HAINES SARAH ELIZABETH(sha) (512) 475-4993

The information contained in this facsimile message is privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the above-named recipient(s) or the individual or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient. You are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately notify us by telephone, and return the original message to us at the address via the U.S. Postal Service. Thank you.

SOAH DOCKET NO. 952-19-0705

APPLICATION OF LOWER COLORADO	§	BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE
RIVER AUTHORITY FOR OPERATING	8	
AND TRANSPORT PERMITS FOR	8	OF
EIGHT WELLS IN BASTROP COUNTY,	8	
TEXAS	§	ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

ORDER NO. 5 RULING ON PARTY STATUS

On February 19, 2019, the General Manager of the Lost Pines Groundwater Conservation District (General Manager) and Recharge Water, LP (Recharge) filed objections to certain claims of party status. On February 19, 2019, the Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) filed a response to party status; however, it stated that it does not object to the party status of any entity or individual who filed an affidavit. Aqua Water Supply Corporation (Aqua), City of Elgin (Elgin), Elvis and Roxanne Hernandez, and the Grissom Landowners filed replies to the General Manager's and Recharge's objections to party status.

The General Manager objected to the party status of the following: Mark and Penny Whiting, Tommy Claiborne, Sue Pardue, Felix and Beverly Villareal, Douglas and Dorothy Marousek, Carol and Ernest Pease, Tiger Davis, Donna Nelson, Maria and Paul Tuttrup, Sandi Schneiderman, Sue Ellen Christiansen, Esther Martinez, Stephen Shaw, Becky Jean Nichols, Paul E. Cox, Keith and Judy Everett, Anne and Donald Ross, Jason Sims and Paula Hanks, David and Elizabeth Babin, and Kimberly and James Walker. The General Manager argues that these individuals show nothing more than mere ownership of real property with attendant groundwater rights and generalized complaints about impact that might occur from the drawdown of water if LCRA's permits are granted. LCRA contends that the generalized claims do not establish a personal justiciable interest required by Chapter 36 of the Water Code.¹

¹ Application of End Op., L.P. for Well Registration, Operating Permits, and Transfer Permits, SOAH Docket No. 952-13-5210 (Sept. 25, 2013) (Order No. 3).

Recharge challenges the party status of certain landowners that it believes failed to demonstrate that the granting of the LCRA permits may cause actual and imminent injury to their legally protected rights. Like the General Manager, Recharge contends that certain landowners have not established that they have a registered or permitted well near the proposed LCRA wellfield that is completed or authorized to be completed in the Simsboro formation. In addition to the landowners that the General Manager objects to, Recharge also objects to the party status of Michael MacLeod, Marshall and Peggy Hilburn, and JC Jensen.² Recharge also objects to the party status of Kermit Heaton, John Watson, Suzanne Ragan, and Roger P. Fuller.³ Recharge also objects to the party status of Michael and Tammie Hagerud, Philip and Deborah Alley, Steve and Suzannah Amable, Arthur Norman Aronsen, III, Hollie Denton, Claire and Michael Wunderlin, Kathryn Rogers, Larry and Irene Campbell, Newton and Fran Ellis, Roger Fleming, John Ricke, Jr., Lewis Sharpe, III, Catherine and Charles White, IV, Dave Teuscher, Dr. Christian and Bette Abee, and Richard Martinez.4 Recharge also objects to the party status of Elvis and Roxanne Hernandez.⁵ Additionally, Recharge objects to the party status of Philip Cook.⁶ Recharge further objects to the party status of the Pines and Prairies Land Trust c/o Melanie Pavlas (the Trust) and Circle D Civic Association c/o Jeannie Jessup (the HOA). Finally, Recharge objects to the party status of Aqua and Elgin.8

² Recharge asserts that these individuals do not have wells or, if they plan to drill a well, they have not indicated which aquifer their potential well will produce from.

³ Recharge asserts that these individuals have wells on their property but their wells draw from the Queen City aquifer; therefore, LCRA's wells will not likely cause a drawdown at their wells.

⁴ Recharge contends that these individuals have not shown that their wells are in the Simsboro formation. Recharge maintains that an assertion that aquifers are connected is too tenuous to show that any drawdown in other aquifers will cause harm.

⁵ Recharge claims that the mere assertion by Elvis and Roxanne Hernandez that the Calvert Bluff aquifer and the Simsboro aquifer are interconnected is too speculative to show standing.

⁶ Recharge argues that Mr. Cook's wells are fifteen miles away from the LCRA well field and will likely experience zero drawdown.

⁷ Recharge contends that the Trust has not established that its wells are in the Simsboro aquifer. Recharge asserts that the HOA has not shown that any drawdown will have an impact on the HOA's lake.

⁸ Recharge claims that Aqua and Elgin have not shown that their wells are in the Simsboro aquifer and the impact of the drawdown on their wells.

The mandatory standing test is set out in section 36.415(b)(2) of the Texas Water Code. This test, which embodies constitutional standing principles, requires that groundwater districts to limit participants in hearings on well permits to those who have standing to participate, requiring the district to:

[L]imit participation in a hearing on a contested application to persons who have a personal justiciable interest related to a legal right, duty, privilege, power, or economic interest that is within a district's regulatory authority and affected by a permit or permit amendment application, not including persons who have an interest common to members of the public.⁹

In City of Waco v. Tex. Com'n on Environmental Quality, the Court of Appeals in Austin determined "an affected person" must meet the following requirements to have standing to request a contested case hearing before Texas Commission on Environmental Quality:

- (1) an "injury in fact" from the issuance of the permit as proposed—an invasion of a "legally protected interest" that is (a) "concrete and particularized" and (b) "actual or imminent, not conjectural or hypothetical";
- (2) the injury must be "fairly traceable" to the issuance of the permit as proposed, as opposed to the independent actions of third parties or other alternative causes unrelated to the permit; and
- (3) it must be likely, and not merely speculative, that the injury will be redressed by a favorable decision on its complaints regarding the proposed permit (i.e., refusing to grant the permit or imposing additional conditions).¹⁰

Therefore, to prevail on a request for party status, the landowners must show a concrete, particularized injury-in-fact that must be more than speculative, and there must be some evidence that would tend to show that the legally protected interests will be affected by the action.¹¹ The following parties have not demonstrated a particularized injury-in-fact that is not common to the general public because they do not have a well that draws groundwater, and owning land and the

⁹ Tex. Water Code § 36.415(b)(2). District Rule 15.1(E)(2)(d).

¹⁰ City of Waco v. Texas Com'n on Environmental Quality, 346 S.W.3d 781, 802 (Tex.App.-Austin 2011, pet. denied), rev'd on other grounds, 113 S.W.3d 409 (Tex. 2013).

¹¹ City of Waco, 346 S.W.3d at 805. End OP., L.P. v. Meyer, No. 03-18-00049-CV, 2018 WL 4102013 at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin 2018, no pet.).

groundwater under the land is not sufficient to show a particularized injury. The parties that have not established a justiciable interest are: Mark and Penny Whiting, Tommy Claiborne, Sue Pardue, Felix and Beverly Villareal, Douglas and Dorothy Marousek, Carol and Ernest Pease, Tiger Davis, Donna Nelson, Maria and Paul Tuttrup, Sandi Schneiderman, Sue Ellen Christiansen, Esther Martinez, Stephen Shaw, Becky Jean Nichols, Paul E. Cox, Keith and Judy Everett, Anne and Donald Ross, Jason Sims and Paula Hanks, David and Elizabeth Babin, and Kimberly and James Walker. Therefore, their requests for party status are denied. James Allen Tate's request for party status is denied because he failed to file an affidavit. Although these individuals will not be parties, they will be allowed to make public comment at the hearing on the merits.

All other individuals and entities have demonstrated a particularized interest sufficient for party status. However, for the individuals that currently do not have a well on their property (but have stated they plan to drill a well), their testimony, if filed, will have limited weight unless they have drilled a well by the time of the hearing or have concrete written plans to drill a well. For those individuals/entities that draw groundwater from other aquifers or formations, their testimony, if filed, will be also be given the appropriate weight in light of the distance from LCRA's wells.

SIGNED March 5, 2019.

MICHAEL J. O'MALLEY

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE

STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING

LÁURA M. VALDEZ

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE

STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

¹² Application of End Op., L.P. for Well Registration, Operating Permits, and Transfer Permits, SOAH Docket No. 952-13-5210 (Sept. 25, 2013) (Order No. 3).

STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

AUSTIN OFFICE 300 West 15th Street Suite 504 Austin, Texas 78701 Phone: (512) 475-4993 Fax: (512) 322-2061

SERVICE LIST

AGENCY:

Lost Pines Groundwater Conservation District (LPG)

STYLE/CASE:

APPLICATION OF LCRA FOR OPERATING AND TRANSPORT

PERMITS FOR 8 WELLS IN BASTROP CO.

SOAH DOCKET NUMBER:

952-19-0705

REFERRING AGENCY CASE:

STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE

HEARINGS

ALJ MICHAEL J. OMALLEY

REPRESENTATIVE / ADDRESS

PARTIES

ERIC ALLMON ATTORNEY 1206 SAN ANTONIO STREET AUSTIN, TX 78701 (512) 469-6000 (PH) (512) 482-9346 (FAX)

eallmon@lf-lawfirm.com

ENVIRONMENTAL STEWARDSHIP

DOUGLAS G. CAROOM ATTORNEY BICKERSTAFF HEATH DELGADO ACOSTA, LLP 3711 S. MOPAC EXPRESSWAY, BUILDING ONE, SUITE 300 AUSTIN, TX 78746 (512) 472-8021 (PH) (512) 320-5638 (FAX) dcaroom@bickerstaff.com

LOWER COLORADO RIVER AUTHORITY

MICHAEL A. GERSHON ATTORNEY AT LAW LLOYD GOSSELINK ROCHELLE & TOWNSEND, P.C. 816 CONGRESS AVENUE, SUITE 1900 AUSTIN, TX 78701-2478 (512) 322-5872 (PH) (512) 472-0532 (FAX) mgershon@lglawfirm.com

AQUA WATER SUPPLY CORP.

LYN CLANCY
ASSOCIATE GENERAL COUNSEL
LOWER COLORADO RIVER AUTHORITY
P.O. BOX 220 H429
AUSTIN, TX 78703
(512) 473-3378 (PH)
(512) 473-4010 (FAX)
lyn.clancy@lcra.org

LOWER COLORADO RIVER AUTHORITY

GREGORY M. ELLIS ATTORNEY AT LAW 2104 MIDWAY COURT LEAGUE CITY, TX 77573 (713) 705-4861 (PH) (512) 236-5265 (FAX) (713) 705-4861 (CELL) GREG@GMELLIS.LAW

LOST PINES GROUNDWATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT BOARD OF DIRECTORS

EMILY ROGERS
BICKERSTAFF HEATH DELGADO ACOSTA, LLP
3711 S. MOPAC EXPRESSWAY, BUILDING ONE, STE. 300
AUSTIN, TX 78746
(512) 472-8021 (PH)
(512) 320-5638 (FAX)
erogers@bickerstaff.com

LOWER COLORADO RIVER AUTHORITY

NATASHA MARTIN GRAVES DOUGHERTY HEARON & MOODY 401 CONGRESS AVE., SUITE 2700 AUSTIN, TX 78701 (512) 480-5727 (PH) (512) 536-9939 (FAX) nmartin@gdhm.com

LOST PINES GROUNDWATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT

DONALD H. GRISSOM ATTORNEY GRISSOM & THOMPSON, LLP 509 W 12TH STREET AUSTIN, TX 78701 (512) 478-4059 (PH) (512) 482-8410 (FAX) don@gandtlaw.com

KAY AND AYA LINENBERGER-LUEDERS

MICHAEL AND TAMMY HAGERUD

PHILIP AND DEBORAH ALLEY

DR. CHRISTIAN ABEE

ROGER FLEMING

HOLLIE DENTON

ARTHUR NORMAN ARONSEN, III

DAVID TEUSCHER

LEWIS SHARPE, III

JOHN RICKIE JR.

KERMIT HEATON

NEWTON AND FRAN ELLIS

ELIZABETH AND DAVID BABIN

STEVE AND SUZANNAH AMABLE

MICHAEL MACLEOD

ANDREW AND MARY WIER

ROGER P. FULLER

KATHRYN "KAY" ROGERS

SUZANNE RAGAN

CLAIRE AND MICHAEL WUNDERLIN

PHILIP COOK

HUGH BROWN

LARRY AND IRENE CAMPBELL

STEPHEN SHAW

PAULA HANKS AND JASON SIMS

DON AND ANNE ROSS

CATHERINE AND CHARLES L. WHITE

WALTER WINSLETT

PEGGY JO AND MARSHALL HILBURN

JAMES AND KIMBERLY WALKER

KEITH AND JUDY EVERETT

MARK AND PENNY WHITING

BECKY JEAN NICHOLS

TOMMY CLAIBORNE

ESTHER MARTINEZ

SUE ELLEN CHRISTIANSEN

DOUGLAS AND DOROTHY MAROUSEK

SUE PARDUE

FELIX AND BEVERLY VILLAREAL

PAUL E. COX

JOHN WATSON

SANDI SCHNEIDERMAN

CAROL AND ERNEST PEASE

TIGER DAVIS

HERMAN HERMS

PINES AND PRARIES LAND TRUST C/O MELANIE PAVLAS

DONNA NELSON

MARIA AND PAUL TUTTRUP

BERT GODKIN

CIRCLE D HOMEOWNER'S ASSOCIATION C/O JEANNIE JESSUP

MARY A. KEENEY GRAVES DOUGHERTY HEARON & MOODY 401 CONGRESS AVE., SUITE 2700 AUSTIN, TX 78701 (512) 480-5682 (PH) (512) 480-5882 (FAX) mkeeney@gdhm.com

LOST PINES GROUNDWATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT

JC JENSEN
330 PINE TREE LOOP
BASTROP, TX 78602
(254) 319-1192 (PH)
JC.JENSEN@LIVE.COM

JC JENSEN

ELVIS AND ROXANNE HERNANDEZ 644 HERRON TRAIL MC DADE, TX 78650 (512) 321-1331 (PH) RANCHOZUNZUN@GMAIL.COM

ELVIS AND ROXANNE HERNANDEZ

VERNA L DEMENT 9621 N HWY 77 LEXINGTON, TX 78947 (979) 773-4233 (PH) VERNA101@YAHOO.COM

VERNA L DEMENT

JAMES ALAN TATE 267 SAGE RD. BASTROP, TX 78602 (512) 308-6532 (PH) ALANTATE46@AOL.COM

JAMES ALAN TATE

RICHARD MARTINEZ 701 SKYLINE RIDGE LOOKOUT WIMBERLEY, TX 78676 (979) 236-0994 (PH) MARTINEZ RIK@HOTMAIL.COM

RICHARD MARTINEZ

J. TROUPE BREWER
ATTORNEY
LLOYD GOSSELINK ROCHELLE & TOWNSEND, P.C.
816 CONGRESS AVENUE, SUITE 1900
AUSTIN, TX 78701
(512) 322-5858 (PH)
(512) 472-0532 (FAX)
TBREWER@LGLAWFIRM.COM

CITY OF ELGIN

PAUL TERRILL
ATTORNEY
810 WEST 10TH STREET
AUSTIN, TX 78701
(512) 474-9108 (PH)
(512) 474-9888 (FAX)
PTERRILL@TERRILLWALDROP.COM

RECHARGE WATER, LP